Features of electronic states in the vicinity of band gap and atomic structure of Ta- and Nb-doped Li$_7$La$_3$Zr$_2$O$_{12}$

Maxim I. Vlasov $^{ab}$*, Evgenii A. Surzhikov $^a$ E., Alexander Yu. Germov $^c$ E., Evgeniya A. Il’ina $^{a}$ E., Ilya A. Weinstein $^{bd}$ E.

a: Institute of High Temperature Electrochemistry of the Ural Branch of the Russian Academy of Sciences, Ekaterinburg 620990, Russia
b: Nanotech Center, Ural Federal University, Ekaterinburg 620009, Russia
c: M.N. Mikheev Institute of Metal Physics of the Ural Branch of the Russian Academy of Sciences, Ekaterinburg 620990, Russia
d: Institute of Metallurgy of the Ural Branch of the Russian Academy of Sciences, Ekaterinburg 620016, Russia

* Corresponding author: m_vlasov@ihte.ru

This paper belongs to a Regular Issue.

Abstract

Li$_7$La$_3$Zr$_2$O$_{12}$ is one of the most promising materials for Li-conducting solid electrolytes. The incorporation of Ta$^{5+}$ and Nb$^{5+}$ into the Zr$^{4+}$ sites stabilizes its cubic structure and significantly enhances Li-conductivity, due to the formation of Li vacancies. In this research, we have studied the band gap features of Ta and Nb-doped Li$_7$La$_3$Zr$_2$O$_{12}$. Our findings indicate that Nb ions are present not only in the +5 valence state, but also in the +4 state, leading to the formation of oxygen vacancies. In the case of the Ta-doping, such an effect was not observed. This could be the reason for the approximately one order of magnitude higher lithium conductivity observed in the case of the Ta doping, in comparison to the Nb doping.

Keywords

Li$_7$La$_3$Zr$_2$O$_{12}$
Ta and Nb doping
band gap
oxygen vacancies
Nb valence state

© 2023, the Authors. This article is published in open access under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

1. Introduction

Rechargeable Li-ion batteries are widely used energy storage device, particularly in the fields of portable electronic devices and electrical vehicles [1, 2]. However, one of the most serious disadvantages of such batteries, which limit further expansion of their application, is flammability and toxicity of the used organic liquid electrolyte. In this regard, designing of all-solid-state batteries with inorganic solid electrolyte is one of the prospective directions of Li-ion battery development [1, 2]. In addition to the elimination of safety concerns, this approach allows for the use of metallic Li as an anode, resulting in higher voltage and higher energy density [2].

In order for a material to be successfully utilized as an electrolyte, it must satisfy several criteria, particularly high chemical stability, high ionic conductivity, low electronic conductivity, and a wide electrochemical window. Among the numerous types of compounds considered for the role of solid Li-conducting electrolyte, the garnet-type oxides based on Li$_4$Zr$_2$O$_{12}$ (LLZ) are one of the most promising, meeting the above mentioned criteria [1, 3, 4]. LLZ possesses two structural modifications: tetragonal (space group I$_4$/acd) and cubic (space group Ia3d). The tetragonal phase is typical for pure (not doped) LLZ at room temperature, but provides low Li-ion conductivity (~10$^{-6}$ S/cm at room temperature) because all Li sites are fully occupied. The cubic phase shows significantly higher Li-ion conductivity (~10$^{-4}$ S/cm at room temperature), but it needs to be stabilized. A possible way to stabilize the cubic phase of LLZ is partial substitution of Zr with various cations like Al, Y, Ce, Ga, and so on [5, 6], but the most efficient results were obtained for Ta and Nb-doped LLZ [7-9]. It is proposed, that substitution of Zr$^{4+}$ with Ta$^{5+}$ or Nb$^{5+}$ leads to higher crystal lattice disorder, the appearance of Li vacancies, and thus, results in higher Li$^+$ conductivity, which is already acceptable for practical usage.

When studying Li-ion conductivity, the structural features of the crystal lattice are considered to be the most important factor [1-3]. However, a particular role could be also played by the features of electronic structure in the vicinity of the band gap. As electrolyte, the material must have a negligible contribution of electronic conductivity, which means it must have a wide band gap to be a dielectric. From the other hand, various point defects appeared upon structural changes, for example, due to doping, not
only affects ion conductivity, but also usually influence electronic states in the valence and conduction bands, in the band gap [10, 11]. Therefore, correlating all of these properties to each other would provide deeper understanding of the materials properties, which is crucial for further research.

In light of the aforementioned considerations, the present work is aimed at elucidating the features of the electronic states in the vicinity of the band gap of Ta- and Nb-doped LLZ, and at further correlating the results with the known Li-ion conductivity for these materials. Two compositions were selected for this comparative study: Li$_6$La$_{11.75}$Ta$_{0.25}$Zr$_{1.75}$O$_{32}$ (LLZ-Ta) and Li$_6$La$_{11.75}$Zr$_{1.75}$Nb$_{0.25}$O$_{32}$ (LLZ-Nb), were chosen based on our previous results [8, 9] indicating that for these compositions the higher Li-ion conductivity was observed.

2. Experimental section

The synthesis of LLZ-Ta and LLZ-Nb was conducted by sol-gel method with Li$_2$CO$_3$ (high purity grade), La$_2$O$_3$ (analytical grade), Zr(NO$_3$)$_2$·2H$_2$O (analytical grade) and Ta$_2$O$_5$ or Nb$_2$O$_5$ (high purity) as starting materials. La$_2$O$_3$, Ta$_2$O$_5$ and Nb$_2$O$_5$ were pre-calcined at 1000 °C for 1 h. Li$_2$CO$_3$ was taken with a 10% excess to compensate losses of Li$_2$O due to its volatility at high temperatures. The starting reagents Li$_2$CO$_3$ and La$_2$O$_3$ were dissolved in dilute nitric acid (high purity grade). Zr(NO$_3$)$_2$·2H$_2$O and CsHsO$_7$·H$_2$O (reagent grade) were dissolved in a small amount of distilled water. The amount of citric acid introduced into the synthesis was a double excess compared to the metals in the synthesized compound. The resulting solutions were mixed and then hardly-soluble Ta$_2$O$_5$ or Nb$_2$O$_5$ was added. The resulting mixture was evaporated until a gel was formed. The gel was dried at ~200 °C. The resulting product was gradually annealed in air at temperatures of 700, 800 and 900 °C for 1 h to remove organic residues and to form the main phase. After each annealing stage, the powder was ground in an agate mortar. The resulting powder was compressed into tablets at a pressure of 240 MPa, and then, for sintering, the material was annealed at 1150 °C for 1 h in air on a platinum substrate. Sintering was conducted in a bed of powder of the same composition to eliminate losses of Li$_2$O at high temperatures. After the sintering process, the tablets were ground into micron powder for further studies.

The characterization of the samples was conducted through X-ray diffraction (XRD) analysis and particle size distribution analysis. For the XRD analysis, a Rigaku D/MAX-2200VL/PC diffractometer (Cu Kα radiation) was employed. The particle size distribution was quantified using a Malvern Mastersizer 2000 laser diffraction particle size analyzer.

The optical properties of the samples were investigated via diffuse reflectance spectroscopy (DRS) at room temperature. This was conducted using a Shimadzu 2450 UV-Vis spectrometer with an ISR-2200 integrating sphere and BaSO$_4$ as the reference. The sampling interval was 0.5 nm, while the slit width was 2.0 nm. Optical absorption spectra were obtained by transforming the measured diffuse reflectance into the F(R)-function, which is proportional to the optical absorption coefficient. This was performed with the Kubelka–Munk equation [12]:

$$F(R) = (1 - R)^2/2R,$$

where $R$ is the diffuse reflectance coefficient.

The NMR measurements on 93Nb nuclei were carried out using a two-pulse sequence (solid echo): $\delta_{19F} - \tau_{19F} - \delta_{19F} - \delta_{19F} - \delta_{19F} - \text{echo}$. Due to the short spin-lattice relaxation time, the repetition time of the experiment was chosen to be 5 ms. The spectra were measured with delays between pulses $\tau_{19F} = 15 \mu s$ forming an echo signal. The duration of the pulse was selected to be $\delta_{19F} = 1 \mu s$ and power of the RF amplifier was set at 270 W. The recording of the spectra was performed by summing Fourier transformed signals that were accumulated within the frequency range from 115 to 129 MHz with a step $\Delta f = 100$ kHz. The spectra were processed using “Simul” software [13].

3. Results and discussion

3.1. Characterization of the materials

The characterization of the synthesized materials was performed using the XRD method. According to this analysis, all synthesized samples exhibited a cubic LLZ garnet structure with the $Ia3d$ space group, with no any additional phases (Figure 1a). Using the obtained data, the lattice parameters $a$ for the samples were calculated: 12.9788 and 12.9475 Å for LLZ-Nb and LLZ-Ta, respectively. It is known that cubic pure LLZ has a value of $a = 12.9894$ Å [14]. The slight decrease in the lattice parameter of doped LLZ can be explained by the smaller ionic radius of Nb$^{5+}$ and Ta$^{5+}$ (both 0.64 Å for 6-coordinated) compared to Zr$^{4+}$ (0.72 Å for 6-coordinated) and its decrease correlates well with the increase of concentration of the dopant (Nb, Ta).

To enhance the reliability of DRS measurements, the particle size distribution for powder samples was investigated. The outcomes of the laser scattering method (Figure 1b) demonstrate that all powder samples exhibit identical particle size distributions, thereby enabling the DRS results from these samples to be compared with each other.

3.2. Optical and structural properties

The obtained F(R) spectra for LLZ-Ta and LLZ-Nb are presented in Figure 2a. Both of them show an evident sharp increase at high-energy part, which is related to the inter-band electronic transitions. For Ta-doped LLZ it is located at $hv > 4.0$ eV, and for Nb-doped LLZ it is shifted to higher energies and starts at $hv > 4.6$ eV. To estimate the band-gap value $E_g$ the Tauc method [15] was applied. It establishes the relationship between the absorption coefficient α (in our case, F(R)) and the incident photon energy $hv$ according to the following equation:
where \( A \) is a constant depending on the transition probability, and \( n \) is an indicator that characterizes the process of optical absorption (equals to 2 and 1/2 for indirect allowed and direct allowed transitions, respectively). The \( E_g \) can be determined from the intercept of the fitted straight line with the abscissa axis (Figure 2b). For LLZ-Ta, \( E_g = 4.1 \) and 3.9 eV for direct and indirect allowed transitions, respectively. For LLZ-Nb the determined \( E_g \) values are evidently higher and equal to 4.7 and 4.6 eV for direct and indirect allowed transitions, respectively.

Figure 1 XRD patterns for LLZ-Ta (1) and LLZ-Nb (2) (a); Particle size distribution for LLZ-Ta (1) and LLZ-Nb (2) (b).

Figure 2 Optical absorption F(R) spectra for LLZ-Ta (1) and LLZ-Nb (2) (a); Corresponding Tauc plot for LLZ-Ta (1) and LLZ-Nb (2) for the case of direct allowed transitions (b).

Table 1 presents a summary of the experimentally determined band gap values and several theoretical and experimental data sets from the literature for similar compositions. It is evident that the discrepancies among the results presented by different authors are considerable. This discrepancy is likely due to the use of different calculation methods. However, according to [16], in the case of Ta-doping, the band gap is narrower than in the case of Nb-doping. This is consistent with our experimental findings, even though the absolute calculated \( E_g \) values are lower. It is a common phenomenon for DFT simulations to underestimate the band gap width. In general, a higher band gap width is beneficial for electrolytes in eliminating electronic conductivity. However, it is not the sole determining factor for high ion conductivity. As observed by the authors in [17], the energy positions of the valence and conduction bands relative to the electrochemical potentials of the electrodes are also crucial.

Analyzing the obtained F(R) spectra in Figure 2a one can clearly see that the spectrum of the Nb-doped LLZ is more complex. At energies lower than \( E_g \), in the range of ~4.0–4.6 eV, it shows the broad and intense absorption peak. In oxide compounds such a peak, which overlaps with the absorption edge, is typical for oxygen vacancies: F or F* centers (oxygen vacancies with 2 and 1 trapped electrons, respectively). Such outlook, that Nb-doped LLZ have oxygen vacancies, results in the important conclusion that the real anion content in LLZ-Nb composition (Li_{6.75}La_{0.25}Zr_{1.75}Nb_{0.25}O_{12}) is lower than the nominal value, meaning that the total positive charge (determined by cations) is also lower than the nominal one. Because this effect wasn’t observed in the case of Ta-doped LLZ, it was assumed that the possible reason for this is that Nb ions show valence state lower than +5, as generally expected. To prove such assumption, one of the most reliable ways would be to perform NMR measurements on \(^{93}\)Nb nuclei.

Table 1 Summary of experimental and theoretical data on the band gap width \( E_g \) for LLZ–based compositions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Composition</th>
<th>( E_g ) (eV)</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>This work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li_{6.75}La_{0.25}Zr_{1.75}Ta_{0.25}O_{12}</td>
<td>4.1/3.9</td>
<td>Experiment; Tauc method for allowed transitions (direct / indirect)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li_{6.75}La_{0.25}Zr_{1.75}Nb_{0.25}O_{12}</td>
<td>4.7/4.6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li_{6.75}La_{0.25}Zr_{1.75}Ta_{0.25}O_{12}</td>
<td>3.96</td>
<td>Calculation [16]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li_{6.75}La_{0.25}Zr_{1.75}Nb_{0.25}O_{12}</td>
<td>3.89</td>
<td>Calculation [17]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li_{6.75}La_{0.25}Zr_{1.75}Ta_{0.25}O_{12}</td>
<td>5.85</td>
<td>Calculation [16]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li_{6.75}La_{0.25}Zr_{1.75}Nb_{0.25}O_{12}</td>
<td>5.79 or 6.07 or 6.42</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li_{6.75}Al_{0.25}La_{0.25}Zr_{1.75}O_{12}</td>
<td>5.46</td>
<td>Experiment [17]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li_{6.75}La_{0.25}Zr_{1.75}Ta_{0.25}O_{12}</td>
<td>4.31 or 4.44</td>
<td>Calculation [11]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li_{6.75}La_{0.25}Zr_{1.75}Nb_{0.25}O_{12}</td>
<td>3.64</td>
<td>Experiment; Annealed thin films [18]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

DOI: 10.15826/chimtech.2024.11.2.07
From a structural perspective, the presence of oxygen disorder, which may in turn hinder the diffusion of Li ions. Numerous experimental and theoretical studies have shown that the conductivity is influenced by a multitude of factors, including the ratio between cations, the number of Li vacancies, the types of defects (vacancies, interstitials, etc.), and many others.

4. Limitations

It is well established that LLZ materials exhibit poor stability in air, undergoing decomposition into multiple phases. Consequently, when studying their intricate properties, such as valence states or local structure, it is essential to exercise caution to prevent the formation of impurity phases. To this end, all manipulations were conducted within the argon glovebox, and the measurements were performed without prior prolonged contact with air. The observed NMR effect was also of a high quality, and thus, to compare the integral NMR line intensities and obtain a reliable Nb$^{5+}$/Nb$^{4+}$ ratio, only the most intense central transition was considered.

5. Conclusion

In this study, research on electronic levels in the vicinity of the band gap for Ta and Nb-doped LLZ was performed using optical diffuse reflectance spectroscopy. The estimated band gap widths $E_g$ for both materials are typical to those known from the literature. However, values obtained by various authors may differ significantly, ranging from approximately 2.7 to 6 eV. The most essential finding of the research is the presence in Nb-doped LLZ of oxygen vacancies, as well as Nb transitions and could be fitted by parameters $K = -1640$ ppm, $\nu_q = 0.21$ MHz, LineWidth = 0.21. According to [19], based on the line shifts one can determine the valence state of $^{93}$Nb: Nb$^{4+}$ gives shift of $-1165$ ppm, while Nb$^{5+}$ gives shift of $-1640$ ppm. Fitting of the obtained spectrum indicates that in LLZ-Nb, both valence states of Nb are present with the ratio Nb$^{5+}$/Nb$^{4+}$ = 0.25. This implies that in order to compensate for the lower total positive charge (due to the majority of Nb ions exhibiting a lower valence state than anticipated), oxygen vacancies have emerged. This conclusion is in accordance with the results of DFT calculations of various native defects in LLZ [20], which highlight the complexity of defect chemistry in LLZ, including oxygen vacancies. Furthermore, the calculations indicate that the donor doping (with an element of a higher valence state) does not produce Li vacancies for charge compensation.

Figure 3 The $^{93}$Nb NMR spectra for LLZ-Nb obtained at room temperature. Left inset shows an enlarged fragment and the presence of the second spectrum component (black line is simulation). Right inset shows enlarged fragment and the shape of the pedestal and the signal from the polytetrafluoroethylene ampoule.

The obtained NMR spectrum is presented in Figure 3. It consists of two components. The first one (line 1) includes a pronounced line of the central transition ($+1/2 \leftrightarrow -1/2$) and a broadened pedestal consisting of 8 satellite transitions ($m_i = \pm 1/2 \leftrightarrow \pm 3/2, m_i = \pm 3/2 \leftrightarrow \pm 5/2, m_i = \pm 5/2 \leftrightarrow \pm 3/2$ and so on). The second component (line 2) shows well-resolved transitions and could be fitted by parameters $K = -1640$ ppm, $\nu_q = 0.21$ MHz, LineWidth = 0.21. According to [19], based on the line shifts one can determine the valence state of $^{93}$Nb: Nb$^{4+}$ gives shift of $-1165$ ppm, while Nb$^{5+}$ gives shift of $-1640$ ppm. Fitting of the obtained spectrum indicates that in LLZ-Nb, both valence states of Nb are present with the ratio Nb$^{5+}$/Nb$^{4+}$ = 0.25. This implies that in order to compensate for the lower total positive charge (due to the majority of Nb ions exhibiting a lower valence state than anticipated), oxygen vacancies have emerged. This conclusion is in accordance with the results of DFT calculations of various native defects in LLZ [20], which highlight the complexity of defect chemistry in LLZ, including oxygen vacancies. Furthermore, the calculations indicate that the donor doping (with an element of a higher valence state) does not produce Li vacancies for charge compensation.

A comparison of the Ta- and Nb-doped LLZs reveals that the conductivity is approximately one order of magnitude higher in the Ta-doped case than in the Nb-doped case [8, 9]. From a structural perspective, the presence of oxygen vacancies due to Nb-doping may be a contributing factor to the observed decrease in conductivity. The appearance of these vacancies leads to a higher degree of crystal lattice disorder, which may in turn hinder the diffusion of Li-ions. However, as evidenced by numerous experimental and theoretical results in the literature, it is important to recognize that Li-ion conductivity in LLZ is influenced by a multitude of factors, including the ratio between cations, the number of Li vacancies, the types of defects (vacancies, interstitials, etc.), and many others.

The o
ions in the valence state not only +5, as generally expected, but also +4. The estimated ratio Nb\(^{5+}\)/Nb\(^{4+}\) is 0.25. Since the average valence state of Nb ions in Nb-doped LLZ is lower than +5, then, as the result, the oxygen vacancies are formed in order to compensate the reduced total positive charge. For Ta-doped LLZ such an effect was not observed.

A comparison of the obtained results with the known data on the conductivity of Ta- and Nb-doped LLZ suggests that the presence of oxygen vacancies introduces additional distortions into the crystal lattice, obstructing Li-ion diffusion. This results in a significantly lower Li-ion conductivity in the case of Nb-doped LLZ than in the case of Ta-doped LLZ. However, the findings of the current research, as well as the comprehensive analysis of numerous experimental and theoretical papers, lead to the conclusion that the defect chemistry in LLZ is highly complex, and the conventional approach of simple charge compensation cannot provide an accurate and comprehensive understanding of the material’s diverse properties. Consequently, a further investigation into the valence states of both Nb and Ta, as well as the formation of oxygen vacancies, is required for a wider range of Nb/Ta concentrations in LLZ.

● Supplementary materials

No supplementary materials are available.

● Funding

This work (except NMR measurements and NMR data analysis) was funded by the Russian Science Foundation (grant no. 22-73-00261), https://rscf.ru/en/project/22-73-00261/.

● Acknowledgments

This work was performed using equipment of the Shared Access Center “Composition of Compounds”.

NMR measurements and NMR data analysis were performed by Germov A.Yu. in M.N. Mikheev Institute of Metal Physics of the Ural Branch of the Russian Academy of Sciences (topic “Function”).

● Author contributions

Conceptualization: M.I.V.
Data curation: M.I.V., E.A.S., A.Yu.G.
Formal Analysis: E.A.I.
Investigation: M.I.V., E.A.S., A.Yu.G.
Validation: M.I.V., E.A.I., I.A.W.
Visualization: M.I.V., E.A.S.
Writing - original draft: M.I.V., E.A.S.
Writing - review & editing: M.I.V., I.A.W.

● Conflict of interest

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

● Additional information

Author IDs:
M.I. Vlasov, Scopus ID 57196344424;
A.Yu. Germov, Scopus ID 57180468478;
E.A. Il’ina, Scopus ID 54782706600;
I.A. Weinstein, Scopus ID 7202341325.

Websites:
Institute of High Temperature Electrochemistry of the Ural Branch of the Russian Academy of Sciences, https://ihte.ru/?page_id=3106;

References


11. Santosh KC, Longo RC, Xiong K, Cho K. Point defects in garnet-type solid electrolyte (c-Li$_7$La$_3$Zr$_2$O$_{12}$) for Li-ion batteries. Solid State Ionics. 2014;261:100–105. doi:10.1016/j.ssi.2014.04.021


20. Squires AG, Scanlon DO, Morgan BJ. Native Defects and Their Doping Response in the Lithium Solid Electrolyte Li$_7$La$_3$Zr$_2$O$_{12}$. Chem Mater. 2020;32:1876–1886. doi:10.1021/acs.chemmater.9b04319